IN THE MATTER OF ARBITRATION ) FINAL OFFER INTEREST ARBITRATION ) between ) WERC Case XVIII No. 28275 ) Stanley-Boyd Education ) MED/ARB-1276 Association Decision No. 19252-A and Stanley-Boyd Area School April 23, 1982 District

## APPEARANCES

# For Stanley-Boyd Education Association

Mary Virginia Quarles, CWUC-West UniServ Director Mary Stanek, President Clarice Jessick, Negotiation Team Member Larry Norrell, Negotiation Team Member Thomas LaCourt, Negotiation Team Member

For Stanley-Boyd Area School District

Ken Cole, Director, Employee Relations, WASB Mario D. De Rose, Staff Member, WASB Charles Poulter, Administrator Ronald G. Flaatten, President, School Board Jerome J. Kasper, Vice President, School Board Robert M. Ebben, School Board Member Allan Brown, School Board Member Gary Dorn, School Board Member Norm Christonson, School Board Member

## JURISDICTION OF MEDIATOR-ARBITRATOR

On May 19, 1981, the Parties exchanged their initial proposals on matters to be reopened in the collective bargaining agreement which expires on July 1, 1982; that thereafter the Parties met on two occasions in efforts to reach an accord on a new collective bargaining agreement; that on January 25, 1981, the Association filed the instant petition requesting that the Commission initiate Mediation-Arbitration pursuant to Sec. 111.70(4)(cm)6 of the Municipal Employment Relations Act; that Amedeo Greco, a member of the Commission's staff, conducted an investigation which reflected that the Parties were deadlocked in their negotiations, and, by December 14, 1981, the Parties submitted to said Investigator their final offers, and thereupon the Investigator notified the Parties that the investigation was closed; and that said Investigator has advised the Commission that the Parties remain at impasse.

The Wisconsin Employment Relations Commission having, on January 6, 1982, issued an Order requiring that mediation-arbitration be initiated for the purpose of resolving the impasse arising in collective bargaining between Stanley-Boyd Education Association and Stanley-Boyd Area School District on matters affecting wages, hours and conditions of employment of all full-time and part-time certified

APR 27 1982

WISCONSIN EMPLOYMEND RELATIONS COMMESSION

teachers; and on the same date the Commission having furnished the Parties a panel of Mediator-Arbitrators for the purpose of selecting a single Mediator-Arbitrator to resolve said impasse; and the Commission having, on January 28, 1982, been advised that the Parties had selected Richard J. Miller, New Hope, Minnesota, as the Mediator-Arbitrator.

Pursuant to Section 111.70(4)(cm)6.b. of the Municipal Employment Relations Act, the Mediator-Arbitrator on Thursday, March 11, 1982, at 8:00 p.m. in the library of the Stanley-Boyd High School, Stanley, Wisconsin, attempted to mediate the following issues at impasse for the 1981-82 school year:

1. Salaries

2. Extracurricular Schedule

At about 9:30 p.m. on the same day the Mediator-Arbitrator declared an impasse on all of the heretofore impasse items and at approximately 10:00 p.m. the Parties proceeded to final offer arbitration. Following receipt of positions, contentions and evidence, the Parties filed post hearing briefs which were received on April 16, 1982, at which time the hearing was considered closed.

## POSITIONS OF THE PARTIES

The Association's final offer is as follows for the 1981-82 school year:

STEP	BA	+6	+12	+18	+24	MA	+6	+12	+18	+24
0	12,100	12,300	12,500	12,700	12,900	13,100	13, <u>30</u> 0	13,500	13,700	13,900
1	12,940	13,140	13,340	13,540	13,740	13,940	14,140	14,340	14,540	14,740
2	13,360	13,560	13,760	13,960	14,160	14,360	14,560	14,760	14,960	15,160
3							14,980			
4	14,200	14,400	14,600	14,800	15,000	15,200	15,400	15,600	15,800	16,000
5							15,820			
6	15,040	15,240	15,440	15,640	15,840	16,040	16,240	16,440	16,640	16,840
7	15,460	15,660	15,860	16,060	16,260	16,460	16,660	16,860	17,060	17,260
8	15,880	16,080	16,280	16,480	16,680	16,880	17,080	17,280	17,480	17,680
9	16,300	16,500	16,700	16,900	17,100	17,300	17,500	17,700	17,900	18,100
10	16,720	16,920	17,120	17,320	17,520	17,720	17,920	18,120	18,320	18,520
11							18,340			
12	17,560	17,760	17,960	18,160	18,360	18,560	18,760	18,960	19,160	19,360
13						18,980	19,180	19,380	19,580	19,780
14							19,600	19,800	20,000	20,200

Non-degreed: \$13,360 Longevity: \$ 300 Full Retirement Paid for Each Teacher

EXTRACURRICULAR SCHEDULE - 1981-1982

Percentages based on \$11,000 (1980-81 Base Salary).

Α	Ħ	.10	H ≕ .055
В		.085	I = .05
С	=	.070	J = .045
D	=	.065	K = .04
Е	⇒	.0625	L = .035
F	Π	.0600	M = .03
G	=	•0575	N = .025
			0 = .015

FOOTBALL Head Assistant Freshman	B E E	<u>VOLLEYBALL</u> Head Assistant	C I
Junior High	F	CHEERLEADING	F
BASKETBALL Head	A	DRILL TEAM	K
Assistant Freshman	D E	AUDIO VISUAL	К
Junior High	F	FORENSICS High School	J
WRESTLING		Junior High	М
Head	Α		
Assistant	D	DRAMA 3-Act Play	L
TRACK		1-Act Play	0
Head	С		
Assistant	E	BAND	F
CROSS-COUNTRY	A	VOCAL	K
GYMNASTICS Head Assistant	B E	<u>CLASS ADVISORS</u> Freshman Sophomore Junior Senior	0 0 0 N

•

The School District submits the following as its final offer for the 1981-82 school year:

Base	- \$12,0	)00 Ir	crement	\$400	Lanes	\$150				
<u>Step</u>	BA	<u>+6</u>	<u>+12</u>	+18	<u>†24</u>	MA	+6	<u>+12</u>	<u>+18</u>	<u>+24</u>
0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 11 2 3 4 5 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 11 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11 11	12,800 13,200 13,600 14,000 14,400 14,800 15,200 15,600 16,000 16,400 16,800	12,150 12,950 13,350 13,750 14,150 14,550 14,950 15,350 15,750 16,150 16,550 16,950 17,350	13,100 13,500 13,900 14,300 14,700 15,100 15,500 15,900 16,300 16,700 17,100	13,250 13,650 14,050 14,450 14,850 15,250 15,650 16,050 16,450 16,850 17,250	13,400 13,800 14,200 14,600 15,000 15,400 15,800 16,200 16,600 17,000 17,400	13,600 14,000 14,400 14,800 15,200 15,600 16,000 16,400 16,800 17,200 17,600 18,000	13,750 14,150 14,550 15,350 15,750 16,150 16,550 16,950 17,350 17,750 18,150 18,550	13,900 14,300 14,700 15,100 15,500 15,900 16,300 16,300 16,700 17,100 17,500 17,900 18,300 18,700	14,050 14,450 14,850 15,250 15,650 16,050 16,450 16,850 17,250 17,650 18,050 18,450	14,200 14,600 15,000 15,400 15,800 16,200 16,600 17,000 17,400 17,800 18,200 18,600 19,000

TEACHING EXTRACURRICULAR SCHEDULE

FOOTBALL		GYMNASTICS	
Head	949	Head	949
Assistant Freshman	700 700	Assistant	612
Junior High	651	VOLLEYBALL - GIRLS	
Source urgu	0.51	Head	768
BASKETBALL - BOYS		Assistant	536
Head	1147		
Assistant	743	CHEERLEADING	648
Freshman	700		674
Junior High	651	DRILL TEAM	577

WRESTLING		AUDIO VISUAL	434
Head	1147		
Assistant	743	FORENSICS	
		High School	470
TRACK- BOYS		Junior High	299
Head	788		
Assistant	609	DRAMA	
		3-Act Play (each)	361
CROSS COUNTRY	585	1-Act Play (each)	146
BASKETBALL - GI	RLS	BAND	663
Head	1147		
Assistant	743	VOCAL	434
Junior High	651	voorti	-5-
Suffer High	0.51	CLASS ADVISORS	
TRACK - GIRLS		Senior	216
Head	788	Sentor	216
	609	Term i eur	108
Assistant	009	Junior	
			108
		Sophomore	108
			108
		Freshman	108
			108

## ANALYSIS OF THE EVIDENCE

The Mediator-Arbitrator evaluated the final offer of the Parties in light of the criteria set forth in Wisconsin Statutes 111.70(4)(cm)7. The criteria include:

- A. The lawful authority of the municipal employer.
- B. Stipulations of the parties.
- C. The interests and welfare of the public and the financial ability of the unit of government to meet the costs of any proposed settlement.
- D. Comparison of wages, hours and conditions of employment of the municipal employees involved in the arbitration proceedings with the wages, hours and conditions of employment of other employees performing similar services and with other employees generally in public employment in the same community and in comparable communities and in private employment in the same community and in comparable communities.
- E. The average consumer prices for goods and services, commonly known as the cost-of-living.
- F. The overall compensation presently received by the municipal employees, including direct wage compensation, vacation, holidays and excused time, insurance and pensions, medical and hospitalization benefits, the continuity and stability of employment, and all other benefits received.
- G. Changes in any of the foregoing circumstances during the pendency of the arbitration proceedings.
- H. Such other factors, not confined to the foregoing, which are normally or traditionally taken into consideration in the determination of wages, hours and conditions of employment through voluntary collective bargaining, mediation, factfinding, arbitration or otherwise between the parties, in the public service or in private employment.

-4-

The primary comparability group for use in deriving a fair and equitable award is the seven (7) Cloverbelt B Schools (Auburndale, Cadott, Colby, Mosinee, Neillsville, Nekoosa and Stanley-Boyd). A cursory review of Cloverbelt All Schools (the seven Cloverbelt B Schools, plus Altoona, Cornell, Fall Creek, Gilman, Greenwood, Loyal, Owen-Withee and Thorp) was given secondary consideration. Stanley-Boyd ranks fifth in both FTE Classroom Teachers and FTE Pupils in both comparability groups.

With respect to the salary schedule, there are three fundamental differences in the positions of the Parties. First, \$100 separates the Board and the Association at the BA Base. The Board has offered to increase the BA Base \$1,000 from last year's \$11,000 BA Base to \$12,000. The Association, on the other hand, has demanded that the BA Base be raised \$1,100 to \$12,100

Another disparity in the Parties' offers pertains to the size of the vertical experience increment. The Board has offered to raise the increment from \$380 to \$400. The Association has requested that the size of the increment be increased to \$420.

The final difference between the proposals of the Parties with regard to the salary schedule, relates to the size of the increment between the educational lanes. The Board has not offered any increase from last year's \$150 lane spread while the Association has demanded an increase to \$200.

The Parties are between \$34,000 and \$39,600 apart (depending on various methods of costing proposed by the Parties) from a settlement. The total cost of the Board's offer represents a 10.53% increase over last year, while the Association's proposal is a 12.97% increase.

The rate of inflation, as measured by the Consumer Price Index, rose 8.2% between January 1981 and January 1982. The CPI rose 10.7% between July, 1980 and July, 1981. The Board's total package offer is well in excess of the CPI and thus is more reasonable. The Association's assumption that only salary increases should be used in comparing the final offers fails to recognize that the Mediator-Arbitrator under 111.70(F) must consider the overall compensation (total package) received by the bargaining unit members, including direct wage compensation and all other benefits received.

The Board's offer in this matter (and in most interest arbitration cases) better serves the interest and welfare of the public (111.70[C]), because it generates a lower total package cost than the Association's offer. However, the interest and welfare of the public in this case becomes an ancillary consideration in that the School District admitted that it has the ability to pay for any of the proposed final offers.

Although the CPI supported the District's final total package offer in both Cloverbelt B Schools and Cloverbelt All Schools, the total package settlement pattern supports the Association's final offer. The Cloverbelt B settlement pattern establishes a total package average of 12.74% Cloverbelt All Schools has an average Of the seven points on the salary schedule explored by the Association (BA Minimum, BA+7, BA Maximum, MA Minimum, MA+10, MA Maximum and Schedule Maximum) all are relevant to this case, albeit 40% of the Stanley-Boyd teachers are located in the BA lane alone and only 16% have a MA degree or better and only five teachers are beyond the MA lane. To only examine the BA Minimum, BA+7 and BA Maximum (as suggested by the School District) is being too selective, while exploring all seven points gives a wider spectrum and better serves the purpose of 111.70(D). The data reveals the following:

#### RANKINGS OF STANLEY-BOYD SALARIES CLOVERBELT B SCHOOLS

	<u>1979-80</u>	1980-81	Board <u>1981-82</u>	Association <u>1981-82</u>
BA Minimum	6	4	5	5
BA+7	5	5	5	4
BA Maximum	6	5	6	5
MA Minimum	6	5	6	4
MA+10	5	5	6	5
MA Maximum	7	6	7	6
Schedule Max	. 7	6	7	6

DIFFERENCE FROM AVERAGE AND TOP SALARY OF SETTLED SCHOOLS 1981-82 CLOVERBELT B SCHOOLS

## BA MINIMUM

AVERAGE OF SETTLED

The Board's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$246 below the average salary \$500 below the top salary The Association's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$146 below the average salary \$400 below the top salary

### <u>BA+7</u>

AVERAGE OF SETTLED

The Board's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$342 below the average salary \$616 below the top salary The Association's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$102 below the average salary \$376 below the top salary

#### BA MAXIMUM

AVERAGE OF SETTLED

The Board's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$823 below the average salary \$2,000 below the top salary The Association's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$463 below the average salary \$1,640 below the top salary

# MA MINIMUM

AVERAGE OF SETTLED

The Board's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$514 below the average salary \$991 below the top salary The Association's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$214 below the average salary \$691 below the top salary

#### <u>MA+10</u>

AVERAGE OF SETTLED

The Board's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$1,224 below the average salary \$1,927 below the top salary The Association's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$724 below the average salary \$1,427 below the top salary

\$18,023

\$13,314

\$18,024

# \$12,246

\$15,142

AVERAGE OF SETTLED

\$20,854

The Board's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$2,454 below the average salary \$4,688 below the top salary The Association's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$1,874 below the average salary \$4,108 below the top salary

#### SCHEDULE MAXIMUM

AVERAGE OF SETTLED

\$21.747

The Board's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$2,347 below the average salary \$4,348 below the top salary The Association's offer in Stanley-Boyd is \$1,547 below the average salary \$3,548 below the top salary

Association Exhibits #33-53 show similar information for the entire conference with somewhat similar results, especially the pattern of greater damage to the experienced teacher at the salary maximums.

After analyzing the economic effect of both offers in comparison to the Cloverbelt B Schools and Cloverbelt All Schools, the School District's final offer causes more irreparable harm than does the gains achieved by the Association's proposal.

The major difference between the Parties regarding the extracurricular schedule is that of structure. The Board desires to retain the present structure of the extracurricular schedule while the Association seeks to change that structure. The Association's proposal bases each extracurricular duty on a percentage of last year's BA Base. The present schedule has no such index but merely assigns a dollar amount to each duty.

In terms of cost, the proposals of the Board and the Association are only \$261 apart. Thus, the difference in the costs of the extracurricular salary proposals of the Parties is not extremely significant in the instant case.

A comparison of the rates proposed by the Parties shows some major variations. Those areas that needed major adjustment (the higher rate more than 5% above the lower rate) are Track Assistant, Cross Country, Assistant Gymnastics, Drill Team, Junior High Forensics, One-Act Play, and Class Advisors. The rate proposed by the Association is lower than that proposed by the Board for Drill Team (by \$137). It is also lower for fourteen other rates as listed on the Board's final offer. The Association is higher on the other major adjustments and 14 others, some by as little as \$2.00 while the Board wishes to maintain a schedule with 18 different rates, some only \$3.00 apart.

The evidence reveals that the present structure for the extracurricular schedule dates back to at least the 1971-72 school year. Therefore, the Association has the burden to prove to the Mediator-Arbitrator that the present structure is unfair or inequitable. The Association has met this burden in that its propsal reduces the number of rates; relates them to the time spent on an activity and responsibility of the assignment; and generates a schedule easily carried forward in subsequent negotiations. In addition, according to the extracurricular schedules of Cloverbelt B Schools and Cloverbelt All Schools, the majority of those schools have a structure different than the School District but, admittedly, none of them base their extracurricular salaries on a percentage of last year's base.

It should be noted, however, that the Mediator-Arbitrator gave limited weight to this issue and by no means was it a significant factor in deciding the outcome of the case. Therefore, the paramount issue and the one with the greatest impact on the Parties is the issue of salaries, wherein the Mediator-Arbitrator, having reviewed the evidence and arguments and after applying the statutory criteria of 111.70, makes the following award.

# AWARD

The final offer of the Association, as well as those provisions of the current collective bargaining agreement, are to be incorporated into the collective bargaining agreement as required by statute.

Richard John Miller Richard John Miller

Dated this 23rd day of April 1982 New Hope, Minnesota